

Norfolk County Council

Minutes of the Extraordinary Meeting Held on 2 September 2015

Present:

Mr A **ADAMS**

Mr S **AGNEW**

Mr C **ALDRED**

Mr S **ASKEW**

Mr M BAKER Mr R **BEARMAN**

Mr R **BIRD**

Mr B **BORRETT**

Dr A **BOSWELL**

Mr B **BREMNER**

Mrs J **BROCIEK-COULTON**

Mr A BYRNE

Mr M CASTLE Mrs J **CHAMBERLIN**

Mr J CHILDS

Mr S **CLANCY**

Mr T COKE

Mr D COLLIS

Mr D **CRAWFORD**

Mr A **DEARNLEY**

Mrs M **DEWSBURY**

Mr N **DIXON**

Mr J DOBSON

Mr T **FITZPATRICK**

Mr C FOULGER

Mr T **GARROD**

Mr P **GILMOUR**

Mr A GREY

Mrs S **GURNEY**

Mr P HACON

Mr B **HANNAH**

Mr D **HARRISON**

Mr M Chenery of HORSBRUGH Mrs M WILKINSON

Mr H **HUMPHREY**

Mr B ILES

Mr J JORDAN

Mr J JOYCE

Ms A **KEMP**

Mr M KIDDLE-MORRIS

Mr J **LAW**

Mrs J **LEGGETT**

Mr I **MACKIE**

Mr I MONSON

Ms E **MORGAN**

Mr S **MORPHEW**

Mr G **NOBBS**

Mr R **PARKINSON-HARE**

Mr J PERKINS

Mr G **PLANT**

Mr A PROCTOR

Mr D RAMSBOTHAM

Mr W RICHMOND

Mr D ROPER

Mr M SANDS

Mr E **SEWARD**

Mr N **SHAW**

Mr R **SMITH**

Mr P **SMYTH**

Mr B **SPRATT**

Mr M STOREY

Dr M **STRONG** Mrs A THOMAS

Mr J **TIMEWELL**

Miss J VIRGO

Mr C WALKER

Mr J **WARD**

Ms S WHITAKER

Mr A WHITE

Mr M WILBY

Present: 70

Apologies for Absence:

Apologies for absence were received from Mr M Carttiss, Ms E Corlett, Mrs H Cox, Mr T East, Mr S Hebborn, Mr T Jermy, Mr B Long, Mr J Mooney, Mr W Northam, Ms C Rumsby, Mrs M Somerville, Mr D Thomas and Mr B Watkins.

1 Chairman's Announcements

1.1 There were no Chairman's Announcements.

2 Declarations of Interest

2.1 No Declarations of Interest were made.

3 Norwich Northern Distributor Road Budget

- 3.1 Council received the report of the Executive Director of Communities and Environmental Services and the Executive Director of Finance updating Members on the final target cost for the scheme and asking Members to approve a mechanism to fund a budget shortfall of £29.9m.
- 3.2 Members were asked to:
 - 1. Accept the funding proposals from Department for Transport (DfT) and the New Anglia Local Enterprise Partnership (LEP) and confirm a Norfolk County Council contribution of up to £9.9m to meet the budget shortfall;
 - 2. Approve the funding mechanism set out in paragraph 2.8 of the report to deliver the additional funds of up to £9.9m to support the NDR and approve an adjustment to the 2015-18 capital programme to reflect the additional budget requirement and funding as set out in the report.
 - 3. Subject to the approval by DfT of the NDR 'full approval' submission, the Council confirms the award of the Stage 2 construction works to Balfour Beatty, to set the project in motion for an anticipated October 2015 start.
- 3.3 In light of the concerns raised by Dr A Boswell about the application of construction inflation costs, the Executive Director of Communities and Environmental Services, Mr T McCabe, clarified the costings for the NDR scheme.

The Executive Director drew Council's attention to Appendix C of the report, and the target costs offered by Balfour Beatty shown as £178.45m. He added that, as this was a considerable increase on the £148.5m previously proposed, he had asked the Highways Team to develop benchmark figures that could be compared against the Balfour Beatty target to test the reasonableness of the figures proposed by Balfour Beatty.

The first piece of work the Executive Director had commissioned was from Franklin and Andrews, a cost consultant specialist, asking them to assess construction inflation costs between 2010 and 2015. Franklin and Andrews had concluded that the NDR inflation closely matched that experienced on other highways schemes. The Executive Director added that he was happy to concede Dr Boswell's point that the figure of 22%

extracted from the Franklin and Andrews report and quoted on page 17 of the agenda papers, should in fact read 15.68%, although this did not detract from the analysis that the proposed cost was reasonable and reflected construction inflation elsewhere.

The second piece of benchmarking work compared the cost of the A11 dualling with the NDR target cost. The A11 scheme completed by Balfour Beatty, at a cost of £13.7m per mile compared to the NDR costs of £12.5m per mile, which suggested that the NDR target cost was reasonable.

Neither of these benchmarks changed the target cost developed by Balfour Beatty, they simply provided a benchmark against which the reasonableness of the Balfour Beatty proposal could be tested.

The Executive Director added that the alternative to accepting the proposal would be to re-tender the contract which would inevitably lead to a delay of a minimum of six months, which in itself would cost money. He added that, with what was known about construction inflation, there remained a high risk that the actual tender costs would be higher than that proposed from Balfour Beatty. Therefore, the strong advice given by the Executive Director of Communities and Environmental Services was that Council should not re-tender the contract.

- 3.4 Mr G Nobbs, seconded by Mr T Coke, moved the recommendations contained within the report and set out in paragraph 3.2 above.
- Following debate and upon being put to a recorded vote (appendix A), Council **RESOLVED**:
 - 1. To accept the funding proposals from Department for Transport (DfT) and the New Anglia Local Enterprise Partnership (LEP) and confirm a Norfolk County Council contribution of up to £9.9m to meet the budget shortfall;
 - 2. To approve the funding mechanism set out in paragraph 2.8 of the report to deliver the additional funds of up to £9.9m to support the NDR and approve an adjustment to the 2015-18 capital programme to reflect the additional budget requirement and funding as set out in the report.
 - 3. Subject to the approval by DfT of the NDR 'full approval' submission, the Council confirmed the award of the Stage 2 construction works to Balfour Beatty, to set the project in motion for an anticipated October 2015 start.

The meeting ended at 10.50am.

Chairman



If you need this document in large print, audio, Braille, alternative format or in a different language please contact Customer Services 0344 800 8020 or 0344 800 8011 (textphone) and we will do our best to help.

Norfolk County Council Wednesday 2 September 2015 - Recorded Vote ITEM No 3 – Norwich Northern Distributor Road Budget.

FOR	AGAINST.	ABST.		FOR	AGAINST	ABST	
Х			ADAMS Tony	Х			KEMP Alexandra
Х			AGNEW Stephen	Х			KIDDLE-MORRIS Mark
Х			ALDRED Colin	Х			LAW Jason
Х			ASKEW Stephen	Х			LEGGETT Judy
	Х		BAKER Michael		Absent	ı	LONG Brian
	Х		BEARMAN Richard	Х			MACKIE lan
Х			BIRD Richard	Х			MONSON lan
Х			BORRETT Bill		Absent	I.	MOONEY Joe
	Х		BOSWELL Andrew		Х		MORGAN Elizabeth
Х			BREMNER Bert	Х			MORPHEW Steve
Х			BROCIEK-COULTON Julie	Х			NOBBS George
Х			BYRNE Alec		Absent	<u> </u>	NORTHAM Wyndham
	Absent		CARTTISS Michael			Х	PARKINSON-HARE Rex
Х			CASTLE Mick			Х	PERKINS Jim
Х			CHAMBERLIN Jenny	Х			PLANT Graham
Х			CHILDS Jonathon	Х			PROCTOR Andrew
Х			CLANCY Stuart		Х		RAMSBOTHAM David
Х			COKE Toby	Х			RICHMOND William
Х			COLLIS David	Х			ROPER Daniel
	Absent		CORLETT Emma		Absent		RUMSBY Chrissie
	Absent		COX Hilary	Х			SANDS Mike
Х			CRAWFORD Denis	Х			SEWARD Eric
	Х		DEARNLEY Adrian	Х			SHAW Nigel
Х			DEWSBURY Margaret	Х			SMITH Roger
Х			DIXON Nigel			X	SMYTH Paul
Х			DOBSON John		Absent		SOMERVILLE Margaret
	Absent		EAST Tim	Х			SPRATT Bev
Х			FITZPATRICK Tom	Х			STOREY Martin
Х			FOULGER Colin	Х			STRONG Marie
Х			GARROD Tom	Х			THOMAS Alison
	X		GILMOUR Paul		Absent		THOMAS David
	Х		GREY Alan	Х			TIMEWELL John
Х			GURNEY Shelagh	Х			VIRGO Judith
Х			HACON Pat	Х			WALKER Colleen
Х			HANNAH Brian	Х			WARD John
Х			HARRISON David	_	Absent	1	WATKINS Brian
	Absent		HEBBORN Stan	Х			WHITAKER Sue
Х			HORSBRUGH Michael	X			WHITE Tony
X			Chenery of HUMPHREY Harry	X			WILBY Martin
X			ILES Brian	X			WILKINSON Margaret
	Absent		JERMY Terry	+ ^			wilkingon margaret
X			JORDAN Cliff	+			
X			JOYCE James	+			
- ,			JOIOL James	+			
				+			
	<u> </u>			<u> </u>			

With 59 votes in favour, 8 votes against and 3 abstentions, Council RESOLVED to agree the recommendations in the report.