



Scrutiny Committee

Minutes of the Meeting Held on 19 November 2019
at 10:00 am in the Edwards Room, County Hall, Norwich

Present:

Cllr Steve Morpew (Chair)

Cllr Roy Brame
Cllr Ed Connolly
Cllr Emma Corlett
Cllr Phillip Duigan
Cllr Ron Hanton

Cllr Keith Kiddie
Cllr Ed Maxfield
Cllr Joe Mooney
Cllr Dan Roper

Mr Giles Hankinson (Parent Governor Representative)

Substitute Members present:

Cllr Haydn Thirtle for Cllr Alison Thomas
Cllr Terry Jermy for Cllr Chris Jones

Also present:

Cllr John Fisher	Cabinet Member for Children's Services
Cllr Martin Wilby	Cabinet Member for Highways, Infrastructure and Transport
Tom McCabe	Executive Director of Community & Environmental Services
Simon George	Executive Director of Finance and Commercial Services
Fiona McDiarmid	Executive Director Strategy and Governance
Sara Tough	Executive Director Children's Services
Chris Snudden	Director of Inclusion & Learning, Children's Services
John Crowley	Head of Education Achievement & Early Years' Service
Grahame Bygrave	Assistant Director, Highways and Waste
David Allfrey	Infrastructure Delivery Manager
Karen Haywood	Democratic Support and Scrutiny Manager
Tim Shaw	Committee Officer

1 Apologies for Absence

- 1.1 Apologies were received from Cllr Alison Thomas (Cllr Haydn Thirtle substituting), Cllr Chris Jones (Cllr Terry Jermy substituting) and Cllr Richard Price.

2 Minutes

- 2.1 The minutes of the meeting held on 22 October 2019 were declared as an accurate

record and signed by the Chair.

3. Declarations of Interest

- 3.1 Cllr Emma Corlett, Cllr Ed Maxfield and Cllr Hayden Thirtle declared “Other Interests” in the item that gave an overview on key education performance information because they were members of school governing bodies.

4A Urgent Business

- 4.1 No urgent business was discussed

4B Change in the Agenda Order

- 4B.1 The Chair said that he had agreed that the Committee should consider item (9) on the overview of key education performance information before item (8) on Broadland Northway-lessons learnt and one-year monitoring reports.
- 4B.2 The change in the agenda order was necessary because the Cabinet Member for Children’s Services and the Executive Director of Children’s Services would have to leave the meeting early to attend another meeting outside of County Hall.

5. Public Question Time

- 5.1 No public questions were received

6. Local Member Issues/Questions

- 6.1 No local Member questions were received.

7. Call ins

- 7.1 The Committee noted that there were no call-ins for today’s meeting.

8. Overview of Key Education Performance Information

- 8.1 The annexed report (9) gave an overview of key performance measures that Councillors could use to evaluate the effectiveness of the education system in providing an inclusive, good education for all pupils.
- 8.2 Members suggested that the Committee should hold a Member Workshop that could be used as a business development session for Councillors to understand, define and explore when in the year key education performance information should be presented to Committee.
- 8.3 The issues that were considered by the Committee included the following:
- The percentage of schools judged to be good or outstanding
 - Achieving A Good Level of Development in the Early Years Foundation Stage (GLD)
 - Achieving the Expected Standards in Reading, Writing and Mathematics at Key Stage 2
 - At age 16, achieving a standard pass in English and Mathematics (grade 4 -9).

- Post 16 Participation
- Children subject to Permanent Exclusion
- Number of children receiving education at home
- Number of children missing education
- Children and Young People with Special Educational Needs (SEN)
- Looked After Children

8.4 In reply to questions, the Cabinet Member for Children's Services and officers from Children's Services explained the process that had to be followed for the exclusion of children from school, the duty placed on Children's Services to champion high educational standards for all children and the work of the school intervention service in maintaining high education standards.

8.5 It was pointed out that pupils living in rural and urban areas had similar education attainment levels. There were, however, noticeable differences in attainment levels for pupils attending large schools when compared to small schools. There were also attainment gaps for boys and girls in English and Mathematics and for some vulnerable groups of children. All these issues, and other issues identified by Councillors, such as the designated teacher role for Looked After Children and the new Ofsted framework for judging performance, could usefully be discussed at the proposed member workshop.

8.6 The Chair asked for future reports on education issues to include a glossary of terms.

8.7 **RESOLVED**

That the Committee:

- 1. Note the range of educational indicators included in the report.**
- 2. AGREE to hold a Member Workshop that can be used as a business development session for Councillors to understand, define and explore when in the year key education performance information should be presented to the Committee.**

9. Broadland Northway - Lessons Learnt and One Year Monitoring reports

9.1 The annexed report (8) set out the lessons learnt from the Broadland Northway project, following its full opening to the public in April 2018. Included with the Committee report were two separate reports for the Cabinet Member for Highways, Infrastructure and Transport about the lessons learnt from the project and the results of project monitoring one year after its opening.

9.2 The Chair welcomed the invitation that the EDP had given to its readers to raise questions about the contract for the Broadland Northway and the lessons that were learnt for road safety and the environment from such issues as the number of reported accidents, the design of roundabouts and the loss of trees on the route. Questions regarding these and other matters were raised by the Chair and other Councillors throughout the Committee's consideration of this item.

9.3 In reply to questions from Members of the Committee, the Cabinet Member for

Highways, Infrastructure and Transport said that the Broadland Northway project had been concluded within the revised budget of £205 million and, although there were still some costs relating to land acquisitions to be finalised, it was expected that allowances made in the budget would cover these costs. The reasons why the capital costs were higher than originally anticipated were well understood and despite some delays at points in the construction process, the road was delivered on time. The lessons learnt from the delivery of the project were being applied to the Great Yarmouth Third River Crossing project and would be utilised for future schemes. Traffic impacts with the Broadland Northway were in-line with expectations and the various wildlife species monitored and recorded along the route of the Broadland Northway appeared to have adjusted to the road's presence and with the help of mitigation measures no significant detrimental effect was observed. However, the report acknowledged that it was too early to draw conclusions and further monitoring was to be undertaken in future years, as set out in the report.

- 9.4 Fundamental learning points taken from the Broadland Northway project were that early project investment was essential, as was the importance of mitigating risks by, for example, giving the contractor ownership and responsibility for the fully integrated design and delivery of the works and engaging with industry specialists, through a dedicated specialist commercial manager, to ensure adherence to the contract and to support the contract development and procurement processes.
- 9.5 The other lessons learnt included the importance of early engagement with third-parties, such as Network Rail and Utility Companies, which were sources of considerable cost increase and delay on the Broadland Northway project. Early investment in a project during the development stages, and well ahead of the start of the main construction works, were expected to reduce project risks through the establishment of early third-party agreements.
- 9.6 The Committee heard that there were also lessons learnt for the GY3RC project from the regular cross-party Member Group meetings which had advised Councillors about project delivery issues, including project risks and cost increases. An audit, to assess the governance of the GY3RC project, had been completed to ensure that lessons learnt from the Broadland Northway project were applied.
- 9.7 A Councillor suggested that more lessons might have been learnt from the project if Members of the disbanded NDR Working Group had been shown a draft concluding report and asked for their comments.
- 9.8 It was also suggested that the report presented to the Committee should have explained in some detail the borrowing and repayment costs for the Broadland Northway project, as this would have provided a more accurate assessment of the true long-term cost.
- 9.9 In reply to questions, Officers explained why it had taken as long as it had to investigate the more than 1,300 compensation events that were submitted by the contractor Balfour Beatty. Officers said that these were requests for project costs above and beyond those that were included as part of the original works information and these had to be carefully investigated to avoid going to arbitration (under the

terms of the contract).

- 9.10 Members asked for a note to be included with the minutes about the number of signs, bollards and verges that were repaired since the road was opened to the public which outlined the cost and time taken to complete the repair work. Please note that information is attached to these minutes (see appendix a)

9.11 **RESOLVED to recommend to Cabinet**

1. **That the Council write to the Government to suggest that they find a new mechanism for dealing with utility issues in advance of major infrastructure projects.**

By 8 votes in favour and 3 votes against:

2. **That the Committee is supportive of the building of the Norwich Western Link Road.**

By 5 votes in favour and 5 votes against and then on the casting vote of the Chair:

3. **That the reports presented to the Committee are referred to the External Auditors for investigation of an increase in the projects costs and governance arrangements.**

10. Scrutiny Committee Forward Work Plan

- 10.1 The Committee considered the forward work plan.

10.2 **RESOLVED**

That the Committee:

1. **Agree the forward work plan (as set out in the Appendix of a report received on this matter).**
2. **Authorise the Chair and Vice Chair to consider the size and political balance of a task and finish group to scrutinise the ‘cumulative impact of cutting services for families with disabilities’. The task and finish group is asked to develop terms of reference for this scrutiny for final agreement by the Chair and Vice Chair.**

The meeting concluded at 13:40

Chair

Location	Description	Cost	Date
North 3 maintenance area	Remove obstruction	£ 220.18	14/11/2017
North 3 maintenance area	Attend Road Traffic Collision	£ 273.27	23/11/2017
North 3 maintenance area	Repair post	£ 111.06	29/11/2017
North 3 maintenance area	Repair sign	£ 467.88	11/12/2017
North 3 maintenance area	Repair or cut bank	£ 273.27	27/12/2017
North 3 maintenance area	Make safe a dangerous tree	£ 42.18	10/01/2018
North 3 maintenance area	Attend Road Traffic Collision	£ 182.18	06/02/2018
North 3 maintenance area	Repair sign	£ 1,340.46	07/02/2018
North 3 maintenance area	Remove obstruction	£ 111.06	09/03/2018
North 3 maintenance area	Repair sign	£ 298.37	13/03/2018
North 3 maintenance area	Repair post	£ 364.31	20/03/2018
North 3 maintenance area	Repair sign	£ 260.94	26/03/2018
North 3 maintenance area	Attend Road Traffic Collision	£ -	04/04/2018
North 3 maintenance area	Clear oil spill with police assistance	£ 184.80	19/05/2018
North 3 maintenance area	Out of hours emergency	£ 184.80	03/06/2018
North 3 maintenance area	Repair sign	£ 112.64	08/06/2018
North 3 maintenance area	Resolve overgrown verge	£ 130.48	05/07/2018
North 3 maintenance area	Replace sign	£ 112.64	13/07/2018
Airport Roundabout	Replacing signs and damaged kerbs	£ 12,916.00	14/07/2018
North 2 maintenance area	Remove oil or spillage	£ 94.50	09/08/2018
North 2 maintenance area	Remove obstruction	£ 184.80	15/08/2018
North 2 maintenance area	Out of hours emergency	£ 350.20	20/08/2018
North 2 maintenance area	Repair timber fence	£ 172.29	23/08/2018
Rear of Airport	Electrical disconnection / reconnection works to illuminated signs	£ 1,267.70	Sep-18
North 3 maintenance area	Repair sign	£ 184.80	05/09/2018
Wroxham Roundabout	Replacing signs and damaged kerbs	£ 16,380.00	24/09/2018
North 4 maintenance area	Repair chevron damage	£ 231.00	25/09/2018
North 3 maintenance area	Install cones	£ 231.00	26/09/2018
Wroxham Road	Electrical disconnection / reconnection works to illuminated signs	£ 3,832.08	Oct-18
Fir Covert Road	Replacing signs and damaged kerbs	£ 10,400.00	04/11/2018
Reepham Road	Replacing signs and damaged kerbs	£ 10,400.00	11/11/2018
North 2 maintenance area	Repair post	£ -	13/11/2018
North 2 maintenance area	Repair kerb damage	£ -	13/11/2018
North 2 maintenance area	Repair sign	£ -	13/11/2018
North 3 maintenance area	Repair sign	£ 2,547.19	13/11/2018
North 3 maintenance area	Repair kerb damage	£ 915.88	13/11/2018
North 3 maintenance area	Repair sign	£ -	13/11/2018
North 3 maintenance area	Repair sign	£ -	13/11/2018
North 3 maintenance area	Repair post	£ 2,022.32	13/11/2018
Drayton Road	Replacing signs and damaged kerbs	£ 11,200.00	18/11/2018
North Walsham	Replacing signs and damaged kerbs	£ 11,200.00	25/11/2018
Holt Road	Electrical disconnection / reconnection works to illuminated signs	£ 2,613.54	Dec-18
North Walsham Road	Electrical disconnection / reconnection works to illuminated signs	£ 2,613.54	Dec-18
Salhouse Road	Replacing signs and damaged kerbs	£ 11,200.00	03/12/2018
Plumstead Road	Replacing signs and damaged kerbs	£ 10,650.00	10/12/2018
North 3 maintenance area	Repair sign	£ -	11/12/2018
Postwick	Electrical disconnection / reconnection works to illuminated signs	£ 2,613.54	Jan-19
Salhouse Road	Electrical disconnection / reconnection works to illuminated signs	£ 2,613.54	Jan-19
Plumstead Road	Electrical disconnection / reconnection works to illuminated signs	£ 2,711.43	Jan-19
North 2 maintenance area	Repair sign	£ 277.20	08/01/2019
North 3 maintenance area	Repair sign	£ 277.20	02/02/2019
North 3 maintenance area	Out of hours attendance requested by police	£ 277.20	05/02/2019
North 3 maintenance area	Repair sign	£ 57.43	15/03/2019
North 3 maintenance area	Remove obstruction	£ 130.62	10/04/2019
	Total	£ 125,235.52	