

Norfolk County Council

Minutes of the Meeting Held on 17 February 2020

Present:

Cllr Tony Adams
Cllr Brian Long
Cllr Ian Mackie
Cllr Jess Barnard
Cllr Brian Long
Cllr Ian Mackie
Cllr Ed Maxfield
Cllr David Bills

Cllr David **Bills** Cllr Graham **Middleton**

Cllr Bill Borrett Cllr Joe Mooney
Cllr Julie Brociek-Coulton Cllr Steve Morphew
Cllr Sarah Butikofer Cllr George Nobbs

Clir George Nobbs

Clir Penny Carpenter

Clir Judy Oliver

Clir Mick Castle

Clir Stuart Clancy

Clir Greg Peck

Clir Kim Clipsham

Clir Grenge Nobbs

Clir Judy Oliver

Clir Greg Peck

Clir Grenge Nobbs

Cllr David Collis Cllr Richard Price
Cllr Ed Colman Cllr Andrew Proctor
Cllr Ed Connolly Cllr William Richmond

Clir Emma Corlett Clir Dan Roper

Cllr Stuart **Dark** Cllr David **Rowntree**

Cllr Margaret **Dewsbury**Cllr Mike **Sands**Cllr Eric **Seward**Cllr Phillip **Duigan**Cllr Fabian **Eagle**Cllr Thomas **Smith**

Cllr Tim East
Cllr John Fisher
Cllr Bev Spratt

Cllr Tom FitzPatrick
Cllr Andy Grant
Cllr Shelagh Gurney
Cllr Martin Storey

Clir Shelagh Gurney Clir Martin Storey
Clir Ron Hanton Clir Marie Strong

Cllr David **Harrison**Cllr Haydn **Thirtle**Cllr Chenery of **Horsbrugh**Cllr Alison **Thomas**

Cllr Harry **Humphrey** (Chairman) Cllr Vic **Thomson**

Cllr Brian Iles Cllr John Timewell

Cllr Andrew Jamieson Cllr Karen Vincent

Cllr Terry **Jermy** Cllr Colleen **Walker**Cllr Brenda **Jones** Cllr John **Ward**

Cllr Chris **Jones** Cllr Brian **Watkins**

Cllr Alexandra **Kemp** Cllr Fran **Whymark**

Cllr Keith **Kiddie** (Vice-Chairman) Cllr Martin **Wilby**

Cllr Mark **Kiddle-Morris** Cllr Sheila **Young**

Present: 74

Apologies for Absence:

Apologies for absence were received from Cllr Steve Askew; Cllr Claire Bowes; Cllr Roy Brame; Cllr Nigel Dixon; Cllr Colin Foulger; Cllr Sandra Squire and Cllr Tony White.

1 Minutes

- 1.1 The minutes of the Council meeting held on 20 January 2020 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.
- 1.2 The minutes of the Extraordinary Council meeting held on 3 February 2020 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chairman, subject to the inclusion of an apology from Cllr Alison Thomas.

2 Chairman's Announcements

- 2.1 The Chairman formally thanked the Vice-Chairman for attending a number of events on his behalf, after his operation in January 2020, including the full Council meeting and the Citizenship Ceremony.
- 2.2 The Chairman highlighted some of the events attended by Cllr Kiddie, including the Holocaust Memorial Day at St Peter Mancroft in Norwich and the launch of the new Business and Intellectual Property Hub Centre at Great Yarmouth Library.
- 2.3 The Chairman had attended the Royal British Legion's Norfolk County Conference at County Hall where he had heard about the work of the Royal British Legion locally and nationally, as well as a reception and briefing by the Army Engagement Team at the John Innes Centre.

3 Declarations of Interest

- 3.1 No declarations of interest were made.
- 4 To receive any items of business which the Chairman decides should be considered as a matter of urgency.
- 4.1 There were no items of urgent business.

The Chairman adjourned the meeting at 10.15am to allow for a discussion to take place with Group Leaders to finalise the meeting procedure arrangements. The meeting reconvened at 10.37am.

- 5.1 Cllr Steve Morphew, leader of the Labour Group moved a Motion without Notice, in accordance with the procedural rules for Council meetings, to suspend the following procedural rules for the budget Council meeting:
 - "4(ii) A meeting will be held in February each year to determine the Council's budget. The business to be considered at the budget meeting in February shall be limited to the budget and its associated items, subject to the Chair having discretion to accept additional items other than those relating to the budget, but

only in exceptional or urgent circumstances.

And

9.1 NOTICE – Except for motions which can be moved without notice under Rule 10, notice of every motion must be given in writing, signed by the Member of Members of the Council giving the notice, and delivered to the Head of Democratic Services not later than 7 working days before the date of the meeting.

To enable discussion of the following motion:

"Council regrets that the recommendations of Cabinet on the budget that were considered by scrutiny committee are not being brought to Council. Instead the budget proposals have been revised and the revised version is being brought to Council despite not being approved by Cabinet, considered by the Scrutiny Committee and without those changes being brought to Council as amendments as required by the Constitution.

As a consequence, council is being denied the opportunity to consider whether the changes made from the cabinet recommendations are acceptable.

Council further notes the Monitoring Officer's advice that breaches of the constitution that do not fall within the procedure rules of council cannot be raised as point of order in council. Council believes there must be a way for members to challenge, as a point of order in full council, business they believe to be in breach of the constitution

Council therefore resolves to request the Monitoring Officer to present to the next full council meeting a rule change to provide for members to be able to bring a point of order to council on the grounds of a breach of any part of the constitution to be ruled on by the chair of the meeting.'

In the event council agrees to suspend those procedural rules and accept this motion I draw your attention to these parts of the council procedure rules

'19. SUSPENSION AND AMENDMENT OF COUNCIL PROCEDURE RULES SUSPENSION

- (i) All of these Rules, except Rule 13.4 and 14.2 may be suspended by motion on notice or without notice if at least one half of the whole number of Members of the Council are present. Suspension can only be for the duration of the meeting. A motion to suspend the Rules must specify the Rule to be suspended and must be moved in terms limited to an explanation of the reasons for the suspension. It will be seconded in formal terms only and will be put to the Council without debate.
- (ii) Any motion to add to, vary or revoke these Rules will, when proposed and seconded, stand adjourned without discussion to the next ordinary meeting of the Council, except where it is moved as part of the report of the Cabinet.'

This would therefore mean that once I had moved the motion and it had been seconded the item would stand adjourned.'

5.1.1 The motion was seconded by Cllr Emma Corlett.

- 5.1.2 The Chairman ruled that the motion would not be debated and upon being put to a vote, with 26 votes in favour, the motion was **LOST**.
- 6 Norfolk County Council Revenue and Capital Budget 2020-21 to 2023-24.
- The report setting out the budget proposals was received.
- 6.3 The Leader of the Council, Mr A Proctor, moved the budget recommendations as set out below:-

In respect of the Norfolk County Council Revenue Budget 2020-21 and Medium Term Financial Strategy 2020-24 report (Annexe 1):

The (amended) Cabinet recommendations to County Council in respect of the Budget are shown below. As part of considering the proposed Revenue Budget on 13 January, Cabinet also resolved:

To note the statements regarding the uncertain planning environment, robustness of budget estimates, assumptions and risks relating to the 2020-21 budget, and (due to the unique level of uncertainty for budget setting this year) authorise the Executive Director of Finance and Commercial Services, in consultation with the Leader of the Council and the Cabinet Member for Finance, to make any changes required to reflect Final Local Government Finance Settlement information (if available), or changes in council tax and business rates forecasts from District Councils, in order to maintain a balanced budget position for presentation to Full Council.

Changes in the planning position since Cabinet considered the Budget in January have resulted in a revised budget recommendation to Council as reflected in the following recommendations and the updated technical papers appended to this briefing.

ALL REFERENCES IN THE RECOMMENDATIONS RELATE TO THE ANNEXED REPORTS EXCEPT WHERE SPECIFIC REFERENCES TO THE FOLLOWING BRIEFING PAPER ARE SHOWN

Cabinet RESOLVED:

- 1. To agree to recommend to County Council:
 - a) The level of risk and budget assumptions set out in the Robustness of Estimates report (Appendix 4), which underpin the revenue and capital budget decisions and planning for 2020-24.
 - b) The principle of seeking to increase general fund balances in 2020-21 and that any additional resources which become available during the year should be added to the general fund balance wherever possible.
 - c) The findings of public consultation (Appendix 5), which should be considered when agreeing the 2020-21 Budget (Appendix 1).

- d) An overall County Council Net Revenue Budget of £430.421m for 2020-21, including budget increases of £114.785m and budget decreases of £93.656m as set out in Table 11 of Appendix 1, and the actions required to deliver the proposed savings. [note budget totals in bold updated from Cabinet position]
- e) The budget proposals set out for 2021-22 to 2023-24, including authorising Executive Directors to take the action required to deliver budget savings for 2021-22 to 2023-24 as appropriate.
- f) With regard to the future years, that further plans to meet the remaining budget shortfalls in the period 2021-22 to 2023-24 are developed and brought back to Cabinet during 2020-21.
- g) To note the advice of the Executive Director of Finance and Commercial Services (Section 151 Officer), in section 6 of Appendix 1, on the financial impact of an increase in council tax, and confirm, or otherwise, the assumptions that:
 - i) the council's 2020-21 budget will include a general council tax increase of 1.99% and a 2.00% increase in the Adult Social Care precept, an overall increase of 3.99% (shown in section 6 of Appendix 1) based on the current discretions offered by Government and as recommended by the Executive Director of Finance and Commercial Services.
 - ii) the council's budget planning in future years will include council tax increases of 1.99% for planning purposes, as set out in the Medium Term Financial Strategy (MTFS Table 4 in Appendix 2). These council tax assumptions have regard to the level of referendum threshold expected to be set for the year, and take into account the Government's historic assumptions that local authorities will raise the maximum council tax available to them. The final level of council tax for future years is subject to Member decisions annually.
 - iii) no future increases in the Adult Social Care precept in 2021-22 onwards are assumed based on current Government policy but that these will be subject to Member decisions annually within and informed by any parameters defined by the Government.
 - iv) if the referendum threshold were increased in the period 2021-22 to 2023-24 to above 1.99%, or any further discretion were offered to increase the Adult Social Care precept (or similar), then it is likely that the Section 151 Officer would recommend the council take advantage of this flexibility in view of the council's overall financial position as set out in the assumptions in section 5 of Appendix 1.
- h) That the Executive Director of Finance and Commercial Services be authorised to transfer from the County Fund to the Salaries and General Accounts all sums necessary in respect of revenue and capital expenditure provided in the 2020-21 Budget, to make payments, to raise and repay loans,

and to invest funds.

- i) To agree the Medium Term Financial Strategy 2020-24 as set out in Appendix 2, including the two policy objectives to be achieved:
 - i) Revenue: To identify further funding or savings for 2021-22 and 2023-24 to produce a balanced budget in all years 2020-24 in accordance with the timetable set out in the Revenue Budget report (Table 1 of Appendix 1).
 - ii) Capital: To provide a framework for identifying and prioritising capital requirements and proposals to ensure that all capital investment is targeted at meeting the Council's priorities.
- j) The mitigating actions proposed in the equality and rural impact assessments (Appendix 6).
- k) Note the planned reduction in non-schools earmarked and general reserves of 37.9% over five years, from £88.709m (March 2019) to £55.109m (March 2024) (Reserves Table 6 in Appendix 3);
- I) Note the policy on reserves and provisions in Section 3 of Appendix 3;
- m) Agree, based on current planning assumptions and risk forecasts set out in Appendix 3:
 - i) for 2020-21, a minimum level of general balances of £19.623m, and
 - ii) a forecast minimum level for planning purposes of
 - 2021-22, £25.982m;
 - 2022-23, £26.343m; and
 - 2023-24, £26.431m.

as part of the consideration of the budget plans for 2020-24, reflecting the transfer of risk from Central to Local Government, and supporting recommendations;

n) Agree the use of non-school Earmarked Reserves, as set out in Reserves Table 5 of Appendix 3.

Matters for decision not considered by the Cabinet meeting 13 January 2020:

2. In May 2019, the County Council considered a report on the Review of Special Responsibility Allowances¹ and resolved that "With regard to the proposal for the allowance scheme not to be uplifted in [2020-]2021 in line with staff salaries, by whatever percentage was agreed, any decision should be made when setting the budget in February 2020 (for [2020-]2021)." County Council must therefore consider whether or not to apply an increase in members' allowances for 2020-21, in line with the staff pay award. The current proposed budget makes provision for an increase in line with the inflationary increase awarded to staff

6

(provided for and assumed to be 2% in the proposed 2020-21 Budget, but subject to national pay award negotiation currently underway). The Leader will move that Council approve an increase in members' allowances in line with the inflationary uplift applied to salaries.

3. That County Council approves the final changes to the proposed Revenue Budget 2020-21 reflecting final District Council forecasts and as set out in the Executive Director of Finance and Commercial Services' covering briefing note.

In respect of the Capital Strategy and Programme 2020-21 report (Annexe 2):

Cabinet RESOLVED to:

- 4. Refer the programme to County Council for approval, including the new and extended capital schemes outlined in Appendix D of the report.
- 5. Recommend to County Council the Council's Flexible Use of Capital Receipts Strategy for 2020-21 to 2021-22 as set out in Section 5 of the report.

Note: Proposed amendments to the Capital Programme since consideration by Cabinet 13 January 2020 are set out in the briefing note.

In respect of the Annual Investment and Treasury Strategy 2020-21 report (Annexe 3):

Cabinet RESOLVED to:

- 6. Endorse and recommend to County Council, the Annual Investment and Treasury Strategy for 2020-21, including:
 - The capital prudential indicators included in the body of the report;
 - The Minimum Revenue Provision Statement 2020-21;
 - The list of approved counterparties at Appendix 4, including working capital facilities for NCC Nurseries Limited (maximum £0.250m), NCC HH Limited (maximum £0.250m) and Independence Matters CIC (Maximum £1m) to be made available from the date of approval by County Council;
 - The treasury management prudential indicators detailed in Appendix 5.

Note: The Minimum Revenue Provision (MRP) Statement 2020-21 has been amended since the recommendation at the Cabinet meeting 13 January 2020, to better explain the Council's use of the previous over-provision of MRP, including the amount brought forward into 2019-20, and also to refer to right-of-use assets which will result from the impact of IFRS16 which will affect the Council's accounts in 2020-21. These changes reflect the latest treasury and audit advice, and the revised policy is appended to the briefing paper with changes highlighted.

6.3 The Cabinet Member for Finance, Cllr Andrew Jamieson, seconded the motion.

6.4 The Leader of the Labour Group, Mr S Morphew, moved the following amendments to the Budget recommendations. The motions would be individually seconded when debated by Council. Amendments 5-10 were seconded by Cllr Brenda Jones.

1. Capital Programme: LED lighting

- a) Allocate £15 million capital over three years to complete the LED replacement programme for street lighting over the next three years.
- b) Increase the interest payments in Finance General to reflect capital borrowing and MRP provision.
- c) Include new line of revenue savings in the CES budget c£400k a year rising to £1.2m after scheme completed.

2. Capital Programme: Norwich Western Link

Remove sums allocated for development and design of the Norwich Western Link and reallocate to schemes to alleviate "rat running" in the villages at the western end of the Broadland Northway in 2020-21 including developing sustainable transport solutions to increase non car based transport and reduce carbon emissions.

3. Revenue Budget 2020-21: Councillor Allowances

- a) To waive the increase in councillor allowances due in April 2020 in line with the strong recommendation of the independent panel.
- b) To vire the saving to CES to be divided equally and added to the £6,000 amount councillors are currently allocated for local highway schemes increasing the amount for each councillor to £6,300.
- c) To extend the scope of the schemes councillors can finance to include projects that benefit their community including promoting environmental protection and tackling climate change.

4. Revenue Budget 2020-21: Leader's Office

 Remove Leader's Office growth pressure of £0.052m provided in the 2020-21 Budget.

5. Revenue Budget 2020-21: Minimum Income Guarantee (1)

- a) Roll back the cuts to Minimum Income Guarantee (MIG) for working aged adults to the level pre April 2019.
- b) Vire equal amounts from CES budgets for (Supplies and Services, Agency and Contract Services and Transport) to ASC to fund the costs.

6. Revenue Budget 2020-21: Minimum Income Guarantee (2)

a) Reverse the changes in the budget recommendations to those recommended by Cabinet by decision on 13 January 2020.

- b) Reverse or delay MIG cuts to the full extent permitted by making use of additional funding from the council tax collection pot not accounted for in the recommendations to Council approved by Cabinet.
- c) Instruct Cabinet and Executive Directors to find in year savings to meet the budget levels recommended by Cabinet to Council at their meeting on 13 January.

7. Revenue Budget 2020-21: Minimum Income Guarantee (3)

Defer further planned MIG cuts for 2020-21 by:

- Deferring increases to residential care providers other than that required for them to meet new minimum wage levels.
- b) Using resultant savings to defer further MIG cuts for 2020-21 to the extent that permits.
- c) Viring savings from waiving the increase on councillor allowances as recommended by the independent panel.
- d) Remove Leader's Office growth pressure of £0.052m provided in the 2020-21 Budget.
- e) Utilising reserves for any shortfall.

8. Revenue Budget 2020-21: Minimum Income Guarantee (4)

Defer further MIG cuts planned for 2020-21 by using £3m from reserves pending announcements from the government of the Fair Funding Review, Adult Care Green Paper, Comprehensive Spending Review, and other announcements by government that will influence the state of the Council's funding for future years.

9. Revenue Budget 2020-21: Minimum Income Guarantee (5)

- a) Amend the decision to cut MIG as planned and instead, using 2017 as the base, upgrade MIG for working aged adults with disabilities in line with the increase in councillor allowances from May 2017. Those rates to have an effective date of 1 April 2020 with no claw back from service users in any cases where there has been an overpayment.
- b) Allocate £2.5m from the Adult Social Services Business Risk reserve to finance this.

10. Revenue Budget 2020-21: Minimum Income Guarantee (6)

- a) In the event that MIG is not increased by government in line with any benefit increases, to upgrade MIG levels such that disabled people receive the full amount of any benefits increase and that it is not absorbed into care costs by default.
- b) To provide a contingency in reserves to allow for an increase in MIG of up to 4% in this eventuality.

- 6.4.1 The Chairman advised that Council would consider Labour Group amendment 5 first. If, upon being debated and voted upon, amendment 5 was lost, the Chairman ruled that amendments 6-10 were similar amendments and therefore could not be debated under Rule 12.2 of the Council Procedure Rules, which stated that "A motion or amendment in similar terms to one that has been rejected at a meeting of Council in the past seven months cannot be moved unless the notice of motion or amendment is signed by at least 21 Members. Once the motion or amendment is dealt with, no one can propose a similar motion or amendment for seven months."
- 6.4.2 Cllr Brenda Jones, in seconding the Labour Group budget amendments 5-10, spoke in support of Labour Group amendment 5.
- 6.4.3 Following debate, the amendment (5) from the Labour Group was put to a recorded vote (Appendix A). With 19 votes in favour, 47 votes against and 7 abstentions, the amendment was **LOST**.
- 6.5 When asked to reconsider his ruling that Labour Group amendments 6-10 were similar in content to amendment 5 and, therefore, they would not be debated by Council under Rule 12.2 of Council Procedure Rules, the Chairman stated that he had taken all the comments into account and his decision that the amendments were similar and would not be debated by Council stood.
- 6.6 The Leader of the Liberal Democrat Group, Cllr Ed Maxfield, proposed the following amendment to the Budget recommendations, seconded by Cllr Eric Seward.

Amendments to Revenue Budget 2020-21

- 1. £1.500m be removed from the saving for ASC046 minimum income guarantee to be funded by £1.500m from Adults Business Risk reserve.
- 2. £0.150m to be spent on additional funding for Road Safety and Highways including £0.050 ringfenced for Broadland Northway maintenance to be funded by £0.026m reduction in the budget for Councillors Allowances through not increasing the allowances in line with the inflationary uplift applied to salaries. A further £0.124m through phasing of the growth for Strategy and Governance Critical capability uplift to ensure Intelligence and Analytics support across all services and through wider efficiencies.
- 6.6.1 The Leader did not accept the proposed amendment which was then debated by Council.
- 6.6.2 Cllr Rowntree proposed under Rule 11.10(k) (That the procedure rules be suspended) to allow ideas to be debated and discussed. The Chairman replied that the motion could not be considered as he had already made his decision which was final and could not be changed or discussed further.
- 6.6.3 In response to a question as to whether a separate vote could be taken on the two elements of the proposed amendment from the Liberal Democrat Group, the

Chairman advised that the amendment would be considered and voted upon in its entirety.

- 6.6.4 Following debate, the amendment from the Liberal Democrat Group was put to a recorded vote (Appendix B). With 26 votes in favour, 43 votes against and 1 abstention, the amendment was **LOST**.
- 6.7 The Chief Legal Officer/Monitoring Officer reiterated that the Chairman had already made a decision that proposed Labour Group amendments 5-10 (paragraph 6.4 above) were of a similar nature and that no further debate would be allowed.
- 6.8 Cllr Rowntree believed his motion at 6.6.2 above should be debated and voted upon. The Chairman replied that, as he had already rejected the motion, it could not be debated by Council.
- 6.9 Cllr Mick Castle moved the Independent Group amendment which was seconded by Cllr Alexandra Kemp.

Use of Dedicated Schools Grant in 2020-21

That the administration submit a proposal to the Schools Forum that £0.500m be taken from the Dedicated Schools Grant to fund appropriate work including pilot schemes in 2020-21 in conjunction with a small number of different Academies and Community Schools – with the necessary expertise – to address the gender gap in education (motion unanimously agreed at the 20 January 2020 Full Council meeting minute 10.4), and improve education attainment across Norfolk.

- 6.9.1 The Leader of the Council did not accept the amendment which was debated by Council.
- 6.9.2 Upon being put to a recorded vote (Appendix C), with 2 votes in favour, 71 votes against and 0 abstentions, the amendment from the Independent Group was **LOST**.
- The following amendment was proposed by Cllr Alexandra Kemp, Independent Member and seconded by Cllr Emma Corlett.

Improving outcomes for Care Leavers

Norfolk County Councillors have a responsibility as Corporate Parents to work to improve outcomes for Care Leavers. In September 2019, there were 597 Care Leavers aged 16 to 24 in Norfolk.

But only 50.5% of Care Leavers in Norfolk are in Education, Employment or Training. Some are in low-paid jobs, struggling to survive, without the family support that other young people rely on.

This amendment provides that, at minimal cost, the County Council's Employment Scheme will extend its existing service in each District to assist Care Leavers into good jobs and to progress into better-paid employment.

Cllr Kemp is working with the Clinical Commissioning Group in West Norfolk to improve job opportunities for Care Leavers at the Queen Elizabeth Hospital, and, at no or little cost, schemes with major employers and council contractors could be set up around the County, providing more security and better chance of career progression and security for Care Leavers, raising awareness with employers about the benefits of employing care leavers, and encouraging employers to guarantee a Care Leaver an interview.

Proposal: Expenditure of £0.007m (£0.001m per District Council area) to be added to the Children's Services budget to advance the aims as set out above. To be funded by reducing the cost pressure from the Removal of "Finance Exchequer Services savings" P&R090 delivered through one-off measures (Detailed on County Council agenda pages 42 and 109) by £0.007m.

6.10.1 Following debate and upon being put to a recorded vote (Appendix D), with 26 votes in favour, 46 votes against and 0 abstentions, the amendment was **LOST**.

The meeting adjourned at 12.50pm and reconvened at 1.15pm.

- 6.11 Council debated each of the Labour Group Amendments 1-5 (in paragraph 6.4 above) which had been moved by Cllr Steve Morphew, Leader of the Labour Group.
- 6.12 1. Capital Programme: LED lighting Seconded by Cllr Terry Jermy.
 - a) Allocate £15 million capital over three years to complete the LED replacement programme for street lighting over the next three years.
 - b) Increase the interest payments in Finance General to reflect capital borrowing and MRP provision.
 - c) Include new line of revenue savings in the CES budget c£400k a year rising to £1.2m after scheme completed.
- 6.12.1 The Leader did not accept the amendment, which was debated by Council.
- 6.12.2 Following debate and upon being put to a recorded vote (Appendix E), with 25 votes in favour, 44 votes against and 0 abstentions the amendment was **LOST**.
- 6.13 **2 Capital Programme: Norwich Western Link** Seconded by Cllr Jess Barnard:

Remove sums allocated for development and design of the Norwich Western Link and reallocate to schemes to alleviate "rat running" in the villages at the western end of the Broadland Northway in 2020-21 including developing sustainable transport solutions to increase non car based transport and reduce carbon emissions.

- 6.13.1 The Leader did not accept the amendment which was debated by Council.
- Following debate and upon being put to a recorded vote (Appendix F), with 14 votes in favour, 51 votes against and 4 abstentions, the amendment was **LOST**.
- 6.14 **3 Revenue Budget 2020-21 : Councillor Allowances** Seconded by Cllr Emma Corlett:

- a) To waive the increase in councillor allowances due in April 2020 in line with the strong recommendation of the independent panel.
- b) To vire the saving to CES to be divided equally and added to the £6,000 amount councillors are currently allocated for local highway schemes increasing the amount for each councillor to £6,300.
- c) To extend the scope of the schemes councillors can finance to include projects that benefit their community including promoting environmental protection and tackling climate change.
- 6.14.1 The Leader did not accept the proposed amendment which was debated by Council.
- 6.14.2 Upon being put to a recorded vote (Appendix G), with 25 votes in favour, 45 votes against and 0 abstentions, the amendment was **LOST**.
- 6.15 **4 Revenue Budget 2020-21: Leader's Office** Seconded by Cllr Colleen Walker

Remove Leader's Office growth pressure of £0.052m provided in the 2020-21 Budget.

- 6.15.1 The Leader did not accept the amendment which was debated by Council.
- Upon being put to a recorded vote (Appendix H), with 20 votes in favour, 44 votes against and 0 abstentions, the amendment was **LOST**.
- 6.16 Council then debated the substantive recommendations as set out on pages 33-36 of the agenda.
- 6.16.1 Following debate and upon being put to a recorded vote (Appendix I), with 45 votes in favour, 21 votes against and 0 abstentions the recommendations were **CARRIED** and Council **RESOLVED** accordingly.

In respect of the Norfolk County Council Revenue Budget 2020-21 and Medium Term Financial Strategy 2020-24 report (Annexe 1):

The (amended) Cabinet recommendations to County Council in respect of the Budget are shown below. As part of considering the proposed Revenue Budget on 13 January, Cabinet also resolved:

To note the statements regarding the uncertain planning environment, robustness of budget estimates, assumptions and risks relating to the 2020-21 budget, and (due to the unique level of uncertainty for budget setting this year) authorise the Executive Director of Finance and Commercial Services, in consultation with the Leader of the Council and the Cabinet Member for Finance, to make any changes required to reflect Final Local Government Finance Settlement information (if available), or changes in council tax and business rates forecasts from District Councils, in order to maintain a balanced budget position for presentation to Full Council.

Changes in the planning position since Cabinet considered the Budget in January have resulted in a revised budget recommendation to Council as reflected in the following recommendations and the updated technical papers appended to this briefing.

ALL REFERENCES IN THE RECOMMENDATIONS RELATE TO THE ANNEXED REPORTS EXCEPT WHERE SPECIFIC REFERENCES TO THE FOLLOWING BRIEFING PAPER ARE SHOWN

Cabinet RESOLVED:

- 1. To agree to recommend to County Council:
 - a) The level of risk and budget assumptions set out in the Robustness of Estimates report (Appendix 4), which underpin the revenue and capital budget decisions and planning for 2020-24.
 - b) The principle of seeking to increase general fund balances in 2020-21 and that any additional resources which become available during the year should be added to the general fund balance wherever possible.
 - c) The findings of public consultation (Appendix 5), which should be considered when agreeing the 2020-21 Budget (Appendix 1).
 - d) An overall County Council Net Revenue Budget of £430.421m for 2020-21, including budget increases of £114.785m and budget decreases of £93.656m as set out in Table 11 of Appendix 1, and the actions required to deliver the proposed savings. [note budget totals in bold updated from Cabinet position]
 - e) The budget proposals set out for 2021-22 to 2023-24, including authorising Executive Directors to take the action required to deliver budget savings for 2021-22 to 2023-24 as appropriate.
 - f) With regard to the future years, that further plans to meet the remaining budget shortfalls in the period 2021-22 to 2023-24 are developed and brought back to Cabinet during 2020-21.
 - g) To note the advice of the Executive Director of Finance and Commercial Services (Section 151 Officer), in section 6 of Appendix 1, on the financial impact of an increase in council tax, and confirm, or otherwise, the assumptions that:
 - i) the council's 2020-21 budget will include a general council tax increase of 1.99% and a 2.00% increase in the Adult Social Care precept, an overall increase of 3.99% (shown in section 6 of Appendix 1) based on the current discretions offered by Government and as recommended by the Executive Director of Finance and Commercial Services.
 - ii) the council's budget planning in future years will include council tax increases of 1.99% for planning purposes, as set out in the Medium Term Financial Strategy (MTFS Table 4 in Appendix 2). These council

tax assumptions have regard to the level of referendum threshold expected to be set for the year, and take into account the Government's historic assumptions that local authorities will raise the maximum council tax available to them. The final level of council tax for future years is subject to Member decisions annually.

- iii) no future increases in the Adult Social Care precept in 2021-22 onwards are assumed based on current Government policy but that these will be subject to Member decisions annually within and informed by any parameters defined by the Government.
- iv) if the referendum threshold were increased in the period 2021-22 to 2023-24 to above 1.99%, or any further discretion were offered to increase the Adult Social Care precept (or similar), then it is likely that the Section 151 Officer would recommend the council take advantage of this flexibility in view of the council's overall financial position as set out in the assumptions in section 5 of Appendix 1.
- h) That the Executive Director of Finance and Commercial Services be authorised to transfer from the County Fund to the Salaries and General Accounts all sums necessary in respect of revenue and capital expenditure provided in the 2020-21 Budget, to make payments, to raise and repay loans, and to invest funds.
- i) To agree the Medium Term Financial Strategy 2020-24 as set out in Appendix 2, including the two policy objectives to be achieved:
 - i) Revenue: To identify further funding or savings for 2021-22 and 2023-24 to produce a balanced budget in all years 2020-24 in accordance with the timetable set out in the Revenue Budget report (Table 1 of Appendix 1).
 - ii) Capital: To provide a framework for identifying and prioritising capital requirements and proposals to ensure that all capital investment is targeted at meeting the Council's priorities.
- j) The mitigating actions proposed in the equality and rural impact assessments (Appendix 6).
- k) Note the planned reduction in non-schools earmarked and general reserves of 37.9% over five years, from £88.709m (March 2019) to £55.109m (March 2024) (Reserves Table 6 in Appendix 3);
- I) Note the policy on reserves and provisions in Section 3 of Appendix 3;
- m) Agree, based on current planning assumptions and risk forecasts set out in Appendix 3:
 - i) for 2020-21, a minimum level of general balances of £19.623m, and
 - ii) a forecast minimum level for planning purposes of
 - 2021-22, £25.982m;

- 2022-23, £26.343m; and
- 2023-24, £26.431m.

as part of the consideration of the budget plans for 2020-24, reflecting the transfer of risk from Central to Local Government, and supporting recommendations:

n) Agree the use of non-school Earmarked Reserves, as set out in Reserves Table 5 of Appendix 3.

Matters for decision not considered by the Cabinet meeting 13 January 2020:

- 2. In May 2019, the County Council considered a report on the Review of Special Responsibility Allowances² and resolved that "With regard to the proposal for the allowance scheme not to be uplifted in [2020-]2021 in line with staff salaries, by whatever percentage was agreed, any decision should be made when setting the budget in February 2020 (for [2020-]2021)." County Council must therefore consider whether or not to apply an increase in members' allowances for 2020-21, in line with the staff pay award. The current proposed budget makes provision for an increase in line with the inflationary increase awarded to staff (provided for and assumed to be 2% in the proposed 2020-21 Budget, but subject to national pay award negotiation currently underway). Council approved an increase in members' allowances in line with the inflationary uplift applied to salaries.
- 3. That County Council **approved** the final changes to the proposed Revenue Budget 2020-21 reflecting final District Council forecasts and as set out in the Executive Director of Finance and Commercial Services' covering briefing note.

In respect of the Capital Strategy and Programme 2020-21 report (Annexe 2):

Cabinet RESOLVED to:

- 4. Refer the programme to County Council for approval, including the new and extended capital schemes outlined in Appendix D of the report.
- 5. Recommend to County Council the Council's Flexible Use of Capital Receipts Strategy for 2020-21 to 2021-22 as set out in Section 5 of the report.

Note: Proposed amendments to the Capital Programme since consideration by Cabinet 13 January 2020 are set out in the briefing note.

<u>In respect of the Annual Investment and Treasury Strategy 2020-21 report</u> (Annexe 3):

Cabinet RESOLVED to:

6. Endorse and recommend to County Council, the Annual Investment and Treasury Strategy for 2020-21, including:

16

- The capital prudential indicators included in the body of the report;
- The Minimum Revenue Provision Statement 2020-21;
- The list of approved counterparties at Appendix 4, including working capital facilities for NCC Nurseries Limited (maximum £0.250m), NCC HH Limited (maximum £0.250m) and Independence Matters CIC (Maximum £1m) to be made available from the date of approval by County Council;
- The treasury management prudential indicators detailed in Appendix 5.

Note: The Minimum Revenue Provision (MRP) Statement 2020-21 has been amended since the recommendation at the Cabinet meeting 13 January 2020, to better explain the Council's use of the previous over-provision of MRP, including the amount brought forward into 2019-20, and also to refer to right-of-use assets which will result from the impact of IFRS16 which will affect the Council's accounts in 2020-21. These changes reflect the latest treasury and audit advice, and the revised policy is appended to the briefing paper with changes highlighted.

The meeting concluded at 2.30pm.

Chairman



If you need this document in large print, audio, Braille, alternative format or in a different language please contact Customer Services 0344 800 8020 or 0344 800 8011 (textphone) and we will do our best to help.

RECORDED VOTE – Labour Group Budget Amendment (5).

	For	Against	Abstain			For	Against	Abstair
ADAMS Tony		X			KIDDIE Keith		Х	
ADAMS Timothy			Х		KIDDLE-MORRIS Mark		Х	
AQUARONE Steffan		Absent			LONG Brian		Х	
ASKEW Stephen		Absent			MACKIE lan		Х	
BARNARD Jess	Х				MAXFIELD Edward			Х
BILLS David		Х			MIDDLETON Graham		Х	
BORRETT Bill		Х			MOONEY Joe		Х	
BOWES Claire		Absent	•		MORPHEW Steve	Х		
BRAME Roy		Absent			NOBBS George	Х		
BROCIEK-COULTON	Х				OLIVER Judy		Х	
Julie								
BUTIKOFER Sarah			Х		OLIVER Rhodri		Х	
CARPENTER Penny		Х			PECK Greg		Х	
CASTLE Mick	Х				PLANT Graham		Х	
CLANCY Stuart		Х			PRICE Richard		Х	
CLIPSHAM Kim	Х				PROCTOR Andrew		Х	1
COLLIS David	Х				RICHMOND William		Х	
COLMAN Ed		Х			ROPER Dan			Х
CONNOLLY Edward		Х			ROWNTREE David	Х		
CORLETT Emma	Х				RUMSBY Chrissie	Absent	Absent	
DARK Stuart		Х		-	SANDS Mike	Х		
DEWSBURY Margaret		Х			SEWARD Eric			Х
DIXON Nigel		Absent			SMITH Carl		Х	
DOUGLAS Danny	Х				SMITH Thomas		Х	
DUIGAN Phillip		Х			SMITH-CLARE Mike	Х		
EAGLE Fabian		Х		-	SPRATT Bev		Х	
EAST Tim	Х			-	SQUIRE Sandra	Absent		
EYRE Simon		Absent	<u> </u>	-	STONE Barry		Х	
FISHER John		Х		-	STONE Margaret		Х	
FITZPATRICK Tom		Х			STOREY Martin			
FOULGER Colin		Absent	<u> </u>		STRONG Marie			Х
GRANT Andy		Х			THIRTLE Haydn		X	
GURNEY Shelagh		X			THOMAS Alison		X	
HANTON Ron		X			THOMSON Victor		X	
HARRISON David	X	+			TIMEWELL John		X	1
HORSBRUGH Michael		X			VINCENT Karen		X	1
Chenery of					THOUSE INGIGI			
HUMPHREY Harry		X			WALKER Colleen	X	1	
ILES Brian		X	+		WARD John		X	
JAMIESON Andrew		X	+		WATKINS Brian			Х
JERMY Terry	X				WHITE Tony	Absent	1	1
JONES Brenda	X				WHYMARK Fran		Х	
JONES Chris	X				WILBY Martin		X	1
KEMP Alexandra	X				YOUNG Sheila		X	

With 19 votes in favour, 47 votes against and 7 abstentions, the amendment was LOST.

RECORDED VOTE – Liberal Democrat Group Budget Amendment.

	For	Against	Abstain		For	Against	Abstain
ADAMS Tony		Х		KIDDIE Keith		Х	
ADAMS Timothy	Х			KIDDLE-MORRIS Mark		Х	
AQUARONE Steffan		Absent		LONG Brian		Х	
ASKEW Stephen		Absent		MACKIE lan		Х	
BARNARD Jess	Х			MAXFIELD Edward	Х		
BILLS David		Х		MIDDLETON Graham		Х	
BORRETT Bill		Х		MOONEY Joe		Х	
BOWES Claire		Absent		MORPHEW Steve	Х		
BRAME Roy		Absent		NOBBS George	Х		
BROCIEK-COULTON	Х			OLIVER Judy		Х	
Julie				j			
BUTIKOFER Sarah	Х			OLIVER Rhodri		Х	
CARPENTER Penny		Х		PECK Greg		Х	
CASTLE Mick			Х	PLANT Graham		Х	
CLANCY Stuart		Х		PRICE Richard		Х	
CLIPSHAM Kim	Х			PROCTOR Andrew		Х	
COLLIS David	Х			RICHMOND William		Х	
COLMAN Ed		Х		ROPER Dan	Х		
CONNOLLY Edward		Х		ROWNTREE David	Х		
CORLETT Emma	Х			RUMSBY Chrissie	Absent	1	I
DARK Stuart		Х		SANDS Mike	Х		
DEWSBURY Margaret		Х		SEWARD Eric	Х		
DIXON Nigel		Absent		SMITH Carl		Х	
DOUGLAS Danny	Х			SMITH Thomas		Х	
DUIGAN Phillip		Х		SMITH-CLARE Mike	Х		
EAGLE Fabian		Х		SPRATT Bev			
EAST Tim	Х			SQUIRE Sandra	Absent	1	I
EYRE Simon		Absent		STONE Barry		Х	
FISHER John		Х		STONE Margaret		Х	
FITZPATRICK Tom		Х		STOREY Martin			
FOULGER Colin		Absent		STRONG Marie	Х		
GRANT Andy				THIRTLE Haydn		Х	
GURNEY Shelagh		Х		THOMAS Alison		Х	
HANTON Ron		Х		THOMSON Victor		Х	
HARRISON David	Х			TIMEWELL John	Х	1	
HORSBRUGH Michael		Х		VINCENT Karen		1	
Chenery of							
HUMPHREY Harry		Х		WALKER Colleen	Х	†	
ILES Brian		Х		WARD John		Х	
JAMIESON Andrew		Х		WATKINS Brian	Х	1	
JERMY Terry	Х			WHITE Tony	Absent	1	1
JONES Brenda	Х			WHYMARK Fran		Х	
JONES Chris	X		1	WILBY Martin		X	
KEMP Alexandra	X			YOUNG Sheila		X	
INLINIE AIGNAITUIA				1 CONG CHEIRA	1		I

With 26 votes in favour, 43 votes against and 1 abstention, the amendment was LOST.

RECORDED VOTE – Independent Group Budget Amendment.

	For	Against	Abstain		For	Against	Abstain
ADAMS Tony		Х		KIDDIE Keith		Х	
ADAMS Timothy		Х		KIDDLE-MORRIS Mark		Х	
AQUARONE Steffan		Absent	•	LONG Brian		Х	
ASKEW Stephen		Absent		MACKIE lan		Х	
BARNARD Jess		X		MAXFIELD Edward		Х	
BILLS David		Х		MIDDLETON Graham		Х	
BORRETT Bill		Х		MOONEY Joe		Х	
BOWES Claire		Absent	1	MORPHEW Steve		Х	
BRAME Roy		Absent		NOBBS George		Х	
BROCIEK-COULTON		X		OLIVER Judy		Х	
Julie				Í			
BUTIKOFER Sarah		Х		OLIVER Rhodri		Х	
CARPENTER Penny		Х		PECK Greg		Х	
CASTLE Mick	Х			PLANT Graham		Х	
CLANCY Stuart		Х		PRICE Richard		Х	
CLIPSHAM Kim		Х		PROCTOR Andrew		Х	
COLLIS David		Х		RICHMOND William		Х	
COLMAN Ed		Х		ROPER Dan		Х	
CONNOLLY Edward		Х		ROWNTREE David		Х	
CORLETT Emma		Х		RUMSBY Chrissie	Absent	•	•
DARK Stuart		Х		SANDS Mike		Х	
DEWSBURY Margaret		Х		SEWARD Eric		Х	
DIXON Nigel		Absent	•	SMITH Carl		Х	
DOUGLAS Danny		X		SMITH Thomas		Х	
DUIGAN Phillip		Х		SMITH-CLARE Mike		Х	
EAGLE Fabian		Х		SPRATT Bev		Х	
EAST Tim		Х		SQUIRE Sandra	Absent	•	•
EYRE Simon		Absent	•	STONE Barry		Х	
FISHER John		X		STONE Margaret		Х	
FITZPATRICK Tom		Х		STOREY Martin			
FOULGER Colin		Absent		STRONG Marie		Х	
GRANT Andy		Х		THIRTLE Haydn		Х	
GURNEY Shelagh		Х		THOMAS Alison		Х	
HANTON Ron		Х		THOMSON Victor		Х	
HARRISON David		Х		TIMEWELL John		Х	
HORSBRUGH Michael		Х		VINCENT Karen		Х	
Chenery of	<u> </u>						
HUMPHREY Harry		Х		WALKER Colleen		Х	
ILES Brian		Х		WARD John		Х	
JAMIESON Andrew		Х		WATKINS Brian		Х	
JERMY Terry		Х		WHITE Tony	Absent		
JONES Brenda		Х		WHYMARK Fran		Х	
JONES Chris		Х		WILBY Martin		Х	
KEMP Alexandra	Х			YOUNG Sheila		Х	

With 2 votes in favour, 71 votes against and 0 abstentions, the amendment was LOST.

RECORDED VOTE – Clir Alexandra Kemp - Budget Amendment.

	For	Against	Abstain		For	Against	Abstain
ADAMS Tony		Х		KIDDIE Keith		Х	
ADAMS Timothy	Х			KIDDLE-MORRIS Mark		Х	
AQUARONE Steffan		Absent	•	LONG Brian		Х	
ASKEW Stephen		Absent		MACKIE lan		Х	
BARNARD Jess	Х			MAXFIELD Edward	Х		
BILLS David		Х		MIDDLETON Graham		Х	
BORRETT Bill		Х		MOONEY Joe		Х	
BOWES Claire		Absent	1	MORPHEW Steve	Х		
BRAME Roy		Absent		NOBBS George	Х		
BROCIEK-COULTON	Х			OLIVER Judy		Х	
Julie							
BUTIKOFER Sarah	Х			OLIVER Rhodri		Х	
CARPENTER Penny		Х		PECK Greg		Х	
CASTLE Mick	Х			PLANT Graham		Х	
CLANCY Stuart		Х		PRICE Richard		Х	
CLIPSHAM Kim	Х			PROCTOR Andrew		Х	
COLLIS David	Х			RICHMOND William		Х	
COLMAN Ed		Х		ROPER Dan	Х		
CONNOLLY Edward		Х		ROWNTREE David	Х		
CORLETT Emma	Х			RUMSBY Chrissie	Absent	•	•
DARK Stuart		Х		SANDS Mike	Х		
DEWSBURY Margaret		Х		SEWARD Eric	Х		
DIXON Nigel		Absent		SMITH Carl		Х	
DOUGLAS Danny				SMITH Thomas		Х	
DUIGAN Phillip		Х		SMITH-CLARE Mike	Х		
EAGLE Fabian		Х		SPRATT Bev		Х	
EAST Tim	Х			SQUIRE Sandra	Absent		
EYRE Simon		Absent	•	STONE Barry		Х	
FISHER John		X		STONE Margaret		Х	
FITZPATRICK Tom		Х		STOREY Martin			
FOULGER Colin		Absent		STRONG Marie	Х		
GRANT Andy		Х		THIRTLE Haydn		Х	
GURNEY Shelagh		Х		THOMAS Alison		Х	
HANTON Ron		Х		THOMSON Victor		Х	
HARRISON David	Х			TIMEWELL John	Х		
HORSBRUGH Michael		Х		VINCENT Karen		Х	
Chenery of							
HUMPHREY Harry		Х		WALKER Colleen	Х		
ILES Brian		Х		WARD John		Х	
JAMIESON Andrew		Х		WATKINS Brian	Х		
JERMY Terry	Х			WHITE Tony	Absent		
JONES Brenda	Х			WHYMARK Fran		Х	
JONES Chris	Х			WILBY Martin		Х	
KEMP Alexandra	Х			YOUNG Sheila		Х	

With 26 votes in favour, 46 votes against and 0 abstentions, the amendment was LOST.

RECORDED VOTE – Labour Group - Budget Amendment (1).

	For	Against	Abstain		For	Against	Abstain
ADAMS Tony		Х		KIDDIE Keith		Х	
ADAMS Timothy	Х			KIDDLE-MORRIS Mark		Х	
AQUARONE Steffan		Absent		LONG Brian		Х	
ASKEW Stephen		Absent		MACKIE lan		Х	
BARNARD Jess	Х			MAXFIELD Edward	Х		
BILLS David		Х		MIDDLETON Graham		Х	
BORRETT Bill		Х		MOONEY Joe		Х	
BOWES Claire		Absent	:	MORPHEW Steve	Х		
BRAME Roy		Absent	:	NOBBS George	Х		
BROCIEK-COULTON	Х			OLIVER Judy		Х	
Julie							
BUTIKOFER Sarah	Х			OLIVER Rhodri			
CARPENTER Penny		Х		PECK Greg		Х	
CASTLE Mick		Х		PLANT Graham		Х	
CLANCY Stuart		Х		PRICE Richard		Х	
CLIPSHAM Kim	Х			PROCTOR Andrew		Х	
COLLIS David	Х			RICHMOND William		Х	
COLMAN Ed		Х		ROPER Dan	Х		
CONNOLLY Edward		Х		ROWNTREE David	Х		
CORLETT Emma	Х			RUMSBY Chrissie	Absent		
DARK Stuart		Х		SANDS Mike	Х		
DEWSBURY Margaret		Х		SEWARD Eric	Х		
DIXON Nigel		Absent		SMITH Carl		Х	
DOUGLAS Danny	Х			SMITH Thomas			
DUIGAN Phillip		Х		SMITH-CLARE Mike	Х		
EAGLE Fabian		Х		SPRATT Bev			
EAST Tim				SQUIRE Sandra	Absent		
EYRE Simon		Absent	:	STONE Barry		Х	
FISHER John		Х		STONE Margaret		Х	
FITZPATRICK Tom		Х		STOREY Martin			
FOULGER Colin		Absent		STRONG Marie	Х		
GRANT Andy		Х		THIRTLE Haydn		Х	
GURNEY Shelagh		Х		THOMAS Alison		Х	
HANTON Ron		Х		THOMSON Victor		Х	
HARRISON David	Х			TIMEWELL John	Х		
HORSBRUGH Michael		Х		VINCENT Karen		Х	
Chenery of							
HUMPHREY Harry		Х		WALKER Colleen	Х		
ILES Brian		Х		WARD John		Х	
JAMIESON Andrew		Х		WATKINS Brian	Х		
JERMY Terry	Х			WHITE Tony	Absent		
JONES Brenda	Х			WHYMARK Fran		Х	
JONES Chris	Х			WILBY Martin		Х	
KEMP Alexandra	Х			YOUNG Sheila		Х	

With 25 votes in favour, 44 votes against and 0 abstentions, the amendment was LOST.

RECORDED VOTE – Labour Group - Budget Amendment (2).

	For	Against	Abstain			For	Against	Abstain
ADAMS Tony		Х		KIDE	DIE Keith		Х	
ADAMS Timothy			Х	KIDE	OLE-MORRIS Mark		Х	
AQUARONE Steffan		Absent		LON	G Brian		Х	
ASKEW Stephen		Absent		MAC	KIE lan		Х	
BARNARD Jess	Х			MAX	(FIELD Edward		Х	
BILLS David		Х		MIDI	DLETON Graham		Х	
BORRETT Bill		Х		MOC	ONEY Joe		Х	
BOWES Claire		Absent		MOF	RPHEW Steve	Х		
BRAME Roy		Absent		NOB	BBS George			
BROCIEK-COULTON	Х			OLIV	/ER Judy		Х	
Julie								
BUTIKOFER Sarah			Х	OLIV	/ER Rhodri		Х	
CARPENTER Penny		X		PEC	K Greg		Х	
CASTLE Mick		Х			NT Graham		Х	
CLANCY Stuart		Х		PRIC	CE Richard		Х	
CLIPSHAM Kim	Х			PRO	CTOR Andrew		Х	
COLLIS David	Х			RICH	HMOND William		Х	
COLMAN Ed		Х		ROP	PER Dan		Х	
CONNOLLY Edward		Х		ROV	VNTREE David	Х		
CORLETT Emma	Х			RUM	ISBY Chrissie	Absent		
DARK Stuart		Х		SAN	DS Mike			
DEWSBURY Margaret		Х		SEW	/ARD Eric		Х	
DIXON Nigel		Absent		SMIT	TH Carl		Х	
DOUGLAS Danny	X			SMIT	TH Thomas		Х	
DUIGAN Phillip		Х		SMIT	TH-CLARE Mike	Х		
EAGLE Fabian		Х		SPR	ATT Bev			
EAST Tim				SQU	IIRE Sandra	Absent		
EYRE Simon		Absent		STO	NE Barry		Х	
FISHER John		Х		STO	NE Margaret		Х	
FITZPATRICK Tom		Х			REY Martin			
FOULGER Colin		Absent		STR	ONG Marie			Х
GRANT Andy		Х		THIR	RTLE Haydn		Х	
GURNEY Shelagh		Х		THO	MAS Alison		Х	
HANTON Ron		Х		THO	MSON Victor		Х	
HARRISON David		Х		TIME	EWELL John		Х	
HORSBRUGH Michael		Х		VINC	CENT Karen		Х	
Chenery of			<u> </u>					
HUMPHREY Harry		Х		WAL	KER Colleen	Х		
ILES Brian		Х		WAF	RD John		Х	
JAMIESON Andrew		Х		WAT	TKINS Brian			Х
JERMY Terry	Х			WHI.	TE Tony	Absent		
JONES Brenda	Х			WHY	MARK Fran		Х	
JONES Chris	Х			WILE	BY Martin		Х	
KEMP Alexandra	Х			YOU	I NG Sheila		Х	

With 14 votes in favour, 51 votes against and 4 abstentions, the amendment was LOST.

RECORDED VOTE – Labour Group - Budget Amendment (3).

	For	Against	Abstain		For	Against	Abstain
ADAMS Tony		Х		KIDDIE Keith		Х	
ADAMS Timothy	Х			KIDDLE-MORRIS Mark		Х	
AQUARONE Steffan		Absent		LONG Brian		Х	
ASKEW Stephen		Absent	:	MACKIE lan		Х	
BARNARD Jess	Х			MAXFIELD Edward	Х		
BILLS David		Х		MIDDLETON Graham		Х	
BORRETT Bill		Х		MOONEY Joe		Х	
BOWES Claire		Absent	:	MORPHEW Steve	Х		
BRAME Roy		Absent		NOBBS George	Х		
BROCIEK-COULTON	Х			OLIVER Judy		Х	
Julie				· ·			
BUTIKOFER Sarah	Х			OLIVER Rhodri	Х		
CARPENTER Penny		Х		PECK Greg		Х	
CASTLE Mick		Х		PLANT Graham		Х	
CLANCY Stuart		Х		PRICE Richard		Х	
CLIPSHAM Kim	Х			PROCTOR Andrew		Х	
COLLIS David	Х			RICHMOND William		Х	
COLMAN Ed		Х		ROPER Dan	Х		
CONNOLLY Edward		Х		ROWNTREE David	Х		
CORLETT Emma	Х			RUMSBY Chrissie	Absent	•	
DARK Stuart		Х		SANDS Mike	Х		
DEWSBURY Margaret		Х		SEWARD Eric	Х		
DIXON Nigel		Absent	:	SMITH Carl		Х	
DOUGLAS Danny	Х			SMITH Thomas		Х	
DUIGAN Phillip		Х		SMITH-CLARE Mike	Х		
EAGLE Fabian		Х		SPRATT Bev			
EAST Tim				SQUIRE Sandra	Absent		
EYRE Simon		Absent	:	STONE Barry		Х	
FISHER John		Х		STONE Margaret		Х	
FITZPATRICK Tom		Х		STOREY Martin			
FOULGER Colin		Absent	:	STRONG Marie	Х		
GRANT Andy		Х		THIRTLE Haydn		Х	
GURNEY Shelagh		Х		THOMAS Alison		Х	
HANTON Ron		Х		THOMSON Victor		Х	
HARRISON David	Х			TIMEWELL John			
HORSBRUGH Michael		Х		VINCENT Karen		Х	
Chenery of							
HUMPHREY Harry		Х		WALKER Colleen	Х		
ILES Brian		Х		WARD John		Х	
JAMIESON Andrew		Х		WATKINS Brian	Х		
JERMY Terry	Х			WHITE Tony	Absent		
JONES Brenda	Х			WHYMARK Fran		Х	
JONES Chris	Х			WILBY Martin		Х	
KEMP Alexandra	Х			YOUNG Sheila		Х	

With 25 votes in favour, 45 votes against and 0 abstentions, the amendment was LOST.

RECORDED VOTE – Labour Group - Budget Amendment (4).

	For	Against	Abstain		For	Against	Abstain
ADAMS Tony		Х		KIDDIE Keith			
ADAMS Timothy	Х			KIDDLE-MORRIS Mark		Х	
AQUARONE Steffan		Absent		LONG Brian		Х	
ASKEW Stephen		Absent		MACKIE lan		Х	
BARNARD Jess	Х			MAXFIELD Edward	Х		
BILLS David		Х		MIDDLETON Graham		Х	
BORRETT Bill		Х		MOONEY Joe		Х	
BOWES Claire		Absent	:	MORPHEW Steve	Х		
BRAME Roy		Absent		NOBBS George	Х		
BROCIEK-COULTON	Х			OLIVER Judy		Х	
Julie							
BUTIKOFER Sarah				OLIVER Rhodri		Х	
CARPENTER Penny		Х		PECK Greg		Х	
CASTLE Mick				PLANT Graham		Х	
CLANCY Stuart		Х		PRICE Richard		Х	
CLIPSHAM Kim	Х			PROCTOR Andrew		Х	
COLLIS David	Х			RICHMOND William		Х	
COLMAN Ed		Х		ROPER Dan	Х		
CONNOLLY Edward		Х		ROWNTREE David	Х		
CORLETT Emma	Х			RUMSBY Chrissie	Absent		
DARK Stuart		Х		SANDS Mike	Х		
DEWSBURY Margaret		Х		SEWARD Eric	Х		
DIXON Nigel		Absent		SMITH Carl		Х	
DOUGLAS Danny	Х			SMITH Thomas		Х	
DUIGAN Phillip		Х		SMITH-CLARE Mike	Х		
EAGLE Fabian		Х		SPRATT Bev			
EAST Tim				SQUIRE Sandra	Absent		
EYRE Simon		Absent	:	STONE Barry		Х	
FISHER John		Х		STONE Margaret		Х	
FITZPATRICK Tom		Х		STOREY Martin			
FOULGER Colin		Absent	:	STRONG Marie	Х		
GRANT Andy		Х		THIRTLE Haydn		Х	
GURNEY Shelagh		Х		THOMAS Alison		Х	
HANTON Ron		Х		THOMSON Victor		Х	
HARRISON David				TIMEWELL John			
HORSBRUGH Michael		Х		VINCENT Karen		Х	
Chenery of							
HUMPHREY Harry		Х		WALKER Colleen	Х		
ILES Brian		Х		WARD John		Х	
JAMIESON Andrew		Х		WATKINS Brian			
JERMY Terry	Х			WHITE Tony	Absent		
JONES Brenda	Х			WHYMARK Fran		Х	
JONES Chris	Х			WILBY Martin		Х	
KEMP Alexandra				YOUNG Sheila		Х	

With 20 votes in favour, 44 votes against and 0 abstentions, the amendment was LOST.

RECORDED VOTE – Substantive Recommendations (Page 33-36 of Agenda).

	For	Against	Abstain		For	Against	Abstain
ADAMS Tony	Х			KIDDIE Keith	X		
ADAMS Timothy		X		KIDDLE-MORRIS Mark	Х		
AQUARONE Steffan		Absent		LONG Brian	Х		
ASKEW Stephen		Absent		MACKIE lan	Х		
BARNARD Jess		Х		MAXFIELD Edward		Х	
BILLS David	Х			MIDDLETON Graham	Х		
BORRETT Bill	Х			MOONEY Joe	Х		
BOWES Claire		Absent		MORPHEW Steve		Х	
BRAME Roy		Absent	:	NOBBS George		Х	
BROCIEK-COULTON		Х		OLIVER Judy	Х		
Julie							
BUTIKOFER Sarah				OLIVER Rhodri	Х		
CARPENTER Penny	Х			PECK Greg	Х		
CASTLE Mick				PLANT Graham	Х		
CLANCY Stuart	Х			PRICE Richard	Х		
CLIPSHAM Kim		Х		PROCTOR Andrew	Х		
COLLIS David		Х		RICHMOND William	Х		
COLMAN Ed	Х			ROPER Dan		Х	
CONNOLLY Edward	Х			ROWNTREE David		Х	
CORLETT Emma		Х		RUMSBY Chrissie	Absent		
DARK Stuart	Х			SANDS Mike		Х	
DEWSBURY Margaret	Х			SEWARD Eric		Х	
DIXON Nigel		Absent		SMITH Carl	Х		
DOUGLAS Danny		X		SMITH Thomas	Х		
DUIGAN Phillip	Х			SMITH-CLARE Mike		Х	
EAGLE Fabian	Х			SPRATT Bev			
EAST Tim				SQUIRE Sandra	Absent		
EYRE Simon		Absent		STONE Barry	Х		
FISHER John	Х			STONE Margaret	Х		
FITZPATRICK Tom	Х			STOREY Martin			
FOULGER Colin		Absent		STRONG Marie		Х	
GRANT Andy	Х			THIRTLE Haydn	Х		
GURNEY Shelagh	Х			THOMAS Alison	Х		
HANTON Ron	Х			THOMSON Victor	Х		
HARRISON David				TIMEWELL John			
HORSBRUGH Michael	Х			VINCENT Karen	Х		
Chenery of							
HUMPHREY Harry	Х			WALKER Colleen		Х	
ILES Brian	Х			WARD John	Х		
JAMIESON Andrew	Х			WATKINS Brian			
JERMY Terry		Х		WHITE Tony	Absent		
JONES Brenda		Х		WHYMARK Fran	Х		
JONES Chris		Х		WILBY Martin	Х		
KEMP Alexandra		Х		YOUNG Sheila	Х		

With 45 votes in favour, 21 votes against and 0 abstentions, the Recommendations as set out in the report were CARRIED and Council RESOLVED accordingly.